

Verifying knowledge bases: A bibliography

The preceding paper on the refinement of rule-based systems by Preece *et al.* reflects a recent, rapid growth of interest in verification and validation of knowledge based systems. Much of the literature on this subject is thinly spread over conference proceedings, professional periodicals and academic journals, so we have tried to collect together some of the more frequently cited work to assist readers interested in the area.

The focus of the collection is on articles that deal with methods for the static analysis, integrity verification and formal validation of knowledge bases. We have not tried to include material from the (large) literature on knowledge acquisition in this collection, though some papers touch on knowledge base specification and refinement (which are sometimes included under this heading). Nor have we included the substantial literature on performance testing and empirical evaluation of knowledge based and expert systems, though some of the papers are peripherally concerned with this. Finally, we have excluded articles which would be classified as ‘grey literature’; unpublished technical reports, and articles in conferences which are not generally available.

Our selection is inevitably incomplete; the editor apologises to any author whose work has been inadvertently omitted.

Alphabetic list of articles

- Ayel, M, 1988, “Protocols for coherence checking in expert system knowledge bases” In: *Proceedings European Conference on Artificial Intelligence* Springer-Verlag.
- Ayel, M and Laurent, J-P, 1991, “SACCO-SYCOJET: Two different ways of verifying knowledge based systems” In: M Ayel and J-P Laurent, editors, *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems*, 63–76, Wiley.
- Ayel, M and Laurent, J-P, editors, *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems*, Wiley.
- Barrett, BW, 1990, “A hypothetical application of the statistical modelling and estimation of reliability functions for software (SMERFS) to knowledge-based systems (KBSs)” *Expert Systems with applications* 1(3) 281–289.
- Batarekh, A, Preece, AD, Bennett, A and Grogono, P, 1991, “Specifying an expert system” *Expert Systems with Applications* 2(4) 285–303.
- Bellman, KL, editor, 1989, *Proceedings of the IJCAI '89 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems* Palo Alto, CA.
- Bellman, KL, 1990, “The modelling issues inherent in testing and evaluating knowledge based systems” *Expert Systems with Applications* 1(3) 199–216.
- Benbasat, I and Dhaliwal, JS, 1989, “The validation of knowledge acquisition: methodology and techniques” In: *Proceedings 3rd European Knowledge Acquisition Workshop*.
- Bezem, M, 1990, “Consistency of rule-based expert systems” In: E Lusk and R Overbeek, editors, *Proceedings 9th International Conference on Automated Deduction*, 151–161, Springer-Verlag.
- Bull, M, Duda, R, Port, D and Reiter, J, 1987, “Applying software engineering principles to knowledge base development” *Proceedings. First Annual Conference on Expert Systems in Business* 27–38, New York, NY.
- Bundy, A, 1987, “How to improve the reliability of expert systems” In: DS Moralee, editor, *Research Development in Expert Systems IV*, 3–17, Cambridge University Press.
- Chandler, J and Liang, T, editors, 1990, *Developing Expert Systems for Business Applications*, Merrill.
- Chang, CL, Combs, JB and Stachowitz, RA, 1990, “A report on the expert systems validation associate” *Expert Systems with Applications* 1(3) 217–230.
- Charles, E and Dubois, O, 1991, “MELODIA: Logical methods for checking knowledge bases” In: M Ayel and J-P Laurent, editors, *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems*, 95–104, Wiley.
- Cochran, EL and Hutchins, BL, 1987, “Testing, verifying and releasing an expert system” In: *Proceedings 3rd IEEE Conference on AI applications*, Orlando, FL.
- Cragun, BJ and Steudel, HJ, 1987, “Decision table based processor for checking completeness and consistency in rule-based expert systems” *International Journal of J Man-Machine Studies* 26 (5) 633–648.
- Craw, S, 1991, “Judging knowledge base quality” In: M Ayel and J-P Laurent, editors *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems* 207–219, Wiley.

- Craw, S and Sleeman, D, 1990, "Automating the refinement of knowledge based systems" In: *Proceedings 9th European Conference on Artificial Intelligence* Pitman.
- Culbert, C, Riley G and Savely, RT, 1987, "Approaches to the verification of rule-based expert systems" In: *Proceedings 1st Annual Workshop on Space Automation and Robotics*, Houston, TX.
- Geissman, JR and Schultz, RD, 1988, "Verification and validation of expert systems" *AI Expert*, February, 26–33.
- Ginsburg, A, 1988, *Automatic Refinements of Expert System Knowledge Bases* Pitman.
- Ginsburg, A, 1988, "A new approach to checking knowledge bases for inconsistency and redundancy" In: *Proceedings Annual Conference of the American Association of Artificial Intelligence (AAAI)* Morgan Kaufman.
- Ginsburg, A, 1990, "Theory reduction, theory revision and retranslation" In: *Proceedings 8th National Conference on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI)* pp 777–782, MIT Press.
- Goldberg, A, 1986, "Knowledge based programming: a survey of program design and construction techniques" *IEEE Transactions on Software Engineering* 12 (7) 752–768.
- Gorney, DJ and Coleman, KG, 1991, "Expert systems development standards" *Expert Systems with Applications* 2 (4) 239–243.
- Grant J and Minker, I, 1990, "Integrity constraints in knowledge based systems" In: H. Adeli, editor, *Knowledge Engineering . Vol 2: Applications*, 1–24, McGraw Hill.
- Green, CJR and Keyes, MM, 1987, "Verification and validation of expert systems" In: *Proceedings Western Conference on Expert Systems* pp 38-43, IEEE Press.
- Grunwald, S, 1991, "Estimation of failure potential in knowledge bases" In: M Ayel and J-P Laurent, editors, *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems* 163–176, Wiley.
- Guida, G and Tasso, C, 19?? "Building expert systems: From the cycle to development methodology" In: G Guida and C Tasso, editors, *Topics in Expert System Design*, pp 3–24, Elsevier.
- Hamilton, D, Kelley, K and Culbert, C, 1991, "State-of-the-practice in knowledge based system verification and validation" *Expert Systems with Applications* 3 (4) 403–410.
- Hayes-Roth, F, Waterman, D and Lenat, D, 1983, *Building Expert Systems*, Addison-Wesley.
- Hoppe, T, 1990, "Hypotheses generation for knowledge validation" In: *Proceedings 9th European Conference on Artificial Intelligence* Pitman.
- Hoppe, T, 1990, "Aspects of incremental knowledge validation" In: *Proceedings 1st Workshop on Validation Verification and Test of KBS* Stockholm, Sweden.
- Hoppe, T, 1990, "Aspects of incremental knowledge validation" In: M Ayel and J-P Laurent, editors, *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems*, Wiley.
- Hyman, WA, Johnston, WL and Spar, S, 1989, "Legal liability and system safety applied to expert systems" *Computers and Industrial Engineering* 16 (3) 355–362.
- Jacob, RJK and Froscher, JN, 1990, "A software engineering methodology for rule-based systems" *IEEE Transactions on Data and Knowledge Engineering* 2 (2) 173–189.
- Kang, Y and Bahill, AT, 1991, "A tool for detecting expert system error" *AI Expert* February, 46–51.
- Krause, PJ, Byers, P, Hajnal, S and Fox, J, 1991, "The use of object-oriented process specification for the validation and verification of decision support systems" In: M Ayel and J-P Laurent, editors, *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems* 77–91, Wiley.
- O'Keefe, RM and Lee, S, 1990, "An integrative model of expert system verification and validation" *Expert Systems with Applications* 1 (3) 231–236.
- O'Keefe, RM, Balci, O and Smith, EP, 1987, "Validating expert system performance" *IEEE Expert* 2 (4) 81–89.
- Kobayashi, S and Nakamura, K, 1991, "Knowledge compilation and refinement for fault diagnosis" *IEEE Expert* October 39–46.
- Lafon, P, 1991, "A descriptive model of predicates for verifying production systems" In: M Ayel and J-P Laurent, editors, *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems* 149–162, Wiley.
- Landauer, C, 1989, "Principles of rule-based correctness" In: KL Bellman, editor, *Proceedings of the IJCAI '89 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems* Palo Alto, CA.
- Landauer, C, 1990, "Correctness principles for rule-based expert systems" *Expert Systems with Applications* 1 (3) 291–316.
- Laurent, JP and Ayel, M, 1990, "Coherence checking for knowledge bases" In: *8th International Congress on Cybernetics and Systems*, New York, NY.
- Laurent, JP and Ayel, M, 1989, "Off-line coherence checking for knowledge based systems" In: KL Bellman, editor, *Proceedings of the IJCAI '89 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems* Palo Alto, CA.
- Lenat, DB and Guha, RV, 1990, *Building Large Knowledge-Based Systems: Representation and Inference in the CYC Project* Addison-Wesley.

- Linden, TA, 1990, "A meta-level software development model that supports validation and verification for AI Software" *Expert Systems with Applications* 1 (3) 271–279.
- Lopez, B, 1991, "CONKRET: A control knowledge refinement tool" In: M Ayel and J-P Laurent, editors, *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems* 191–206, Wiley.
- Lopez, B, Meseguer, P and Plaza, E, 1990, "Validation of knowledge based systems: state of the art" *AI Communications* 3 (2) 58–72.
- Lyons, PJ, 1992, "Designing knowledge based systems for incremental development" *Expert System with Applications* 4 87–97.
- O'Leary, D, 1987, "Validation of expert systems—with applications to auditing and accounting systems" *Decision Sciences* 18 (3) 468–486.
- O'Leary, D, 19??, "Expert systems prototyping as a research tool" In: E Turban and P Watkins, editors, *Applied Expert Systems* Elsevier.
- O'Leary, D and Kandelin, N, 1988, "Validating the weights in rule-based expert systems: a statistical approach" *International Journal of Expert Systems* 1 (3) 253–279.
- O'Leary, TJ, Goul, M, Moffitt, KE and Radwan, AE, 1990, "Validating expert systems" *IEEE Expert* 5 (3) 51–58.
- de Mantaras, RL, Kerdiles, PF and Larsen, H, 1989, "Validation methods and tools for knowledge based systems (VALID)" In: W Brauer and C Freksa, editors, *Proceedings 3rd Int. GI-Congress* Springer-Verlag.
- Marcot, BG, 1987, "Testing the knowledge base" *AI Expert* 43–47.
- Mazas, P, 1991, "Design knowledge validation through experimentation: the SYSIFE system" In: M Ayel and J-P Laurent, editors, *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems* 119–145, Wiley.
- Mellis, W and Ruckert, M, 1989, "Checking consistency in expert systems" In: *Proceedings 9th International Conference on Expert Systems and their Applications*, Nanterre, France.
- Meseguer, P, 1990, "A new method of checking rule bases for inconsistency: a Petri net approach" In: L C Aiello, editor, *Proceedings 9th European Conference on Artificial Intelligence* Pitman.
- Miller, LA, 1989, "A comprehensive approach to the verification and validation of knowledge-based systems" In: KL Bellman, *Proceedings of the IJCAI '89 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems* Palo Alto, CA.
- Morik, K, 1987, "Acquiring domain models" *International Journal Man-Machines Studies* 26.
- Murray, TJ and Tanniru, 1991, "Control of inconsistency and redundancy in PROLOG-type knowledge bases" *Expert Systems with Applications* 2 (4) 321–331.
- Nazareth, DL, 1989, "Issues in the verification of knowledge in rule-based systems" *International Journal Man-Machine Studies* 30 (3) 255–271.
- Nazareth, DL and Kennedy, MH, 1991, "Verification of rule-based knowledge using directed graphs" *Knowledge Acquisition* 3 (4) 339–360.
- Nguyen, TA, Perkins, WA, Laffey, TJ and Pecora, D, 1985, "Checking an expert system knowledge base for consistency and completeness" In: *Proceedings 9th International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence* vol 1, Morgan Kaufman, 375–378.
- Nguyen, TA, 1987, "Verifying consistency of production systems" In: *Proceedings 3rd Conference on AI Applications* IEEE Computer Society, 4-8.
- Nguyen, TA, Perkins, WA, Laffay, TJ and Pecora, D, 1987, "Knowledge base verification" *AI Magazine* Summer, 67-75.
- Nykanen, P and Nuttila, P, 1991, "Validation and evaluation of a system for thyroid disorders" *Expert Systems with Applications* 3 (2) 289–295.
- Pau, LF, 1987, "Prototyping, validation and maintenance of knowledge based systems software" *Proceedings 3rd Annual Expert Systems in Government Conference*, IEEE Catalog, 248-253.
- Pau, LF, 1991, "Guidelines for prototyping, validation and maintenance of knowledge-based systems software" In: M Ayel and J-P Laurent editors, *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems*, Wiley.
- Perkins, WA, Laffey, TJ, Pecora, D and Nguyen, TA, 1989, "Knowledge base verification" In: G Guida and C Tasso, editors, *Topics in Expert System Design*, Elsevier, 353–376.
- Plant, RT, 1991, "Rigorous approach to the development of knowledge-based systems" *Knowledge Based Systems* 4 (4) 186–195.
- Plant, RT, 1991, "Factors in software quality for knowledge based systems" *Information & Software Technology* 33 (7), 527–536.
- Preece, AD, 1990, "Verification of rule-based systems in wide domains" In: N Shadbolt, editor, *Research and Development in Expert Systems VI* 66–77, Cambridge University Press.
- Preece, AD, Shinghal, R and Batarekh, A, 1992, "Principles and practice in verifying rule-based systems" *Knowledge Engineering Review* 7 (2).

- Puuronen, S, 1987, "A tabular rule-checking method" In: *Proceedings 7th International Workshop on Expert Systems and their Applications* 257–268, Paris.
- Radwan, AI, 1989, "A verification approach for knowledge based systems" *Transportation Research Journal* 23 (4) 287–300.
- Rousset, MC, 1990, "Detection of 'deep' inconsistencies in rule-based systems: the COVADIS system" In: *Proceedings 8th International Congress on Cybernetics and Systems* New York.
- Smith, RG Winston, HA, Mitchell TM and Buchanan, BG, 1985, "Representation of use of explicit justifications for knowledge base refinement" In: *Proceedings 9th International Joint, Conference on Artificial Intelligence* 367–374, Morgan Kaufman.
- Stachowitz, RA and Chang, CL, 1989, "Research on validation of knowledge based systems" In: *Proceedings 2nd Conference on Verification, Validation and Test*, Detroit.
- Suen, CY, Grogono, PD, Shinghal, R and Coallier, R, 1990, "Verifying, validating and measuring the performance of expert systems" *Expert Systems with Applications* 1 (2) 93–102.
- Suwa, M, Scott, AC and Shortliffe, EH, 1985, "Completeness and consistency in a rule-based system" In: BG Buchanan and EH Shortliffe, editors, *Rule-based Systems* Addison Wesley.
- Tepandi, J, 1990, "Verification, testing and validation of rule-based expert systems" In: *Proceedings 11th IFAC World Congress* 7 162–167.
- Tepandi, J, 1991, "Comparison of expert system verification criteria: redundancy" In: M Ayel and J-P Laurent, editors, *Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems*, Wiley.
- Vignollet, L and Ayel, M, 1989, "Generating test sets for knowledge bases" In: *Proceedings 9th International Conference on Expert Systems and their Applications* 247–260, Nanterre, France.
- White, M and Goldsmith J, 1990, *Standards and Review Manual for Certification in Knowledge Engineering* (Sponsored by the International Association of Knowledge Engineers). Rockville, MD. Systemsware.
- Wood, WT and Frankowski, EN, 1989, "Rule based expert system verification" In: KL Bellman, editor, *Proceedings of the IJCAI '89 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems* AAAI.
- Wood, WT and Frankowski, EN, 1990, "Verification of rule-based expert systems" *Expert Systems with Applications* 1 (3) 317–322